

ALYMBEK ASYLBEKOV

Postgraduate Student

Institute of State and Law

National Academy of Sciences of the Kyrgyz Republic

asylbekovalymbek66@gmail.com

ZARINA ABDYKADYROVA

Postgraduate Student

Department of Theory and History of State and Law

International University named after K.Sh. Toktomamatov

z.abdykadyrova@outlook.com

SYRGAK KENZHEBAEV

Doctoral Student

Institute of State and Law

National Academy of Sciences of the Kyrgyz Republic

s-kenzhebaev@hotmail.com

ABAI ZURDINOV

PhD

Institute of State and Law

National Academy of Sciences of the Kyrgyz Republic

a_zurdinov@outlook.com

KAMILA MATEEVA

Associate Professor

Faculty of Law

American University of Central Asia

kmateeva@hotmail.com

STATE, LAW, AND SOCIETY: MECHANISMS OF INTERACTION AND PRESSING ISSUES

ABSTRACT

The purpose of the study was to investigate the mechanisms of interaction between the state, law, society, and to identify the challenges of their functioning. To achieve this goal, an analysis of the current legislation of Kyrgyzstan regulating the interaction of the state, law, and society was carried out, with an emphasis on regulatory mechanisms for civil participation.

As a result of the study, it was found that a model of interaction between the state, law, and society is being formed in Kyrgyzstan, characterised by a gradual transition to partner forms of governance. The creation of civil society institutions, the active participation of non-governmental groups in the implementation of social programmes, and the normative tools for public participation in administrative decision-making are the main mechanisms for such interaction.

The analysis of the current legislation showed the existence of a legal framework for interaction between state bodies and citizens, in particular, through public councils, consulting procedures, and electronic participation platforms.

However, other issues were noted, including the need to strengthen accountability and transparency processes, the lack of a legal culture in some areas, and limited access to participatory mechanisms. Kyrgyzstan's legal system is gradually adapting to the principles of the rule of law, including through the reform of the judiciary, digitalisation of public services, and the implementation of international human rights standards.

However, a significant part of the population remains excluded from real legal influence on public policy due to a lack of access to quality legal information, legal education, and protection mechanisms.

KEYWORDS: State apparatus – Civil society – Legal mechanisms – Democracy – Institutions of power

INDEX: 1. Introduction. – 2. Methodology. – 3. Results. – 4. Discussion – 5. Conclusion.

1. Introduction

The relevance of the study of mechanisms of interaction between the state, law, and society is conditioned by transformational processes in modern socio-political systems, the need to ensure an effective balance between state institutions and civil society, and the need to improve legal mechanisms for regulating these relations in the context of global challenges. Understanding these relationships is key to building stable democratic systems and ensuring the sustainable development of society.

The study by Anisov et al.¹ considered the specifics of the functioning of democratic institutions in the Kyrgyz context, analysing their effectiveness and unique features in the context of post-socialist transformation. According to the researchers, on the one hand, Kyrgyzstan has created the foundations of a democratic system consolidated in the Constitution, a system of separation of powers operates, and basic rights and freedoms of citizens are recognised. The study found that despite the nominal establishment of democratic institutions, the country still has difficulties in implementing constitutional norms. This is relevant given the lack of independence of the judiciary, the insufficient system of checks and balances, and the low level of participation of civil society in political processes. However, Knox and Sharipova², having studied the dynamics of interaction between authoritarian tendencies and the development of civil society in the Central Asian region, argued that in practice, problems such as the lack of a developed culture of legal responsibility, inadequate law enforcement, low public confidence in the court and lack of openness in the activities of official bodies often hinder communication between the state, the legal system, and civil society. This makes it difficult for the rule of law to function effectively and prevents people from fully participating in decision-making processes.

The study by Zadayev³ revealed the features of leadership development and democratisation processes in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan through a comparative analysis of their political systems. Consequently, democratic processes in the Kyrgyz Republic are influenced by the relationship between the population and the state apparatus. Effective cooperation between these institutions helps to increase accountability, transparency, and openness of government, and strengthen public confidence in government structures as part of the creation of a democratic

1 R. ANISOV, G. OMOROVA, U. YUSUPOV, N. NARMATOV, A. KOKOEVA, A. BERENALIEVA, and Z. ABDULLAEVA, Democracy in Kyrgyzstan: Institutions and their features. *Open Journal of Social Sciences*, 9(12), 2021, 94-102. <https://doi.org/10.4236/jss.2021.912008>.

2 C. KNOX, and D. SHARIPOVA, Authoritarianism and civil society in Central Asia: Shifting boundaries. *Journal of Civil Society*, 20(2), 2024, 109-129. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17448689.2024.2324874>.

3 E. ZADAYEV, Leadership and democratization in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan: Comparative analysis of political systems of post-Soviet countries. *International Journal of Political Studies*, 10(2), 2024, 60-77. <https://doi.org/10.25272/icps.1506641>.

state.

According to Axyonova and Tsertsvadze⁴, on the relationship between democratisation processes in transition countries, noted that democracy is based on a variety of opinions and interests that can be taken into consideration when citizens participate in decision-making processes. The state and citizens work together to strengthen institutions of democratic governance and protect human rights and freedoms. Public control allows identifying shortcomings in the activities of state bodies, reducing the likelihood of corruption, and improving the efficiency of management. An important role in increasing the transparency and accountability of government structures, as stated by Junusbekova and Khamitov⁵, public forums, public councils attached to state bodies, and citizen participation in the creation of laws and regulations are some of the mechanisms that contribute to this. The democratisation of society is facilitated by the participation of citizens in management processes through Initiative projects, monitoring groups, petitions, and dialogue platforms. According to the conclusions of Lewis and Sagnayeva⁶, civic engagement increases the legitimacy of decisions made and reduces social tension, as the population feels important in the country's development.

Investigating the features of civil society development in post-Soviet Kyrgyzstan, Pierobon⁷ noted that the state apparatus and civil society, working in partnership, can more effectively address issues such as poverty, unemployment, and inequality. Joint implementation of social programmes allows considering the real needs of the population and ensuring a fair distribution of resources.

4 V. AXONOVA, and T. TSERTSVADZE, Democratization and human rights. In: S. MAYER, J. LEMPP (Eds.), *The EU as an Actor in Central Asia: External Impacts, Regional Responses*. Cham: Palgrave Macmillan, 2024, 213-240. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-51354-1_9.

5 G. JUNUSBKOVA, and Z. KHAMITOV, Anti-corruption monitoring in the public procurement management system in the Republic of Kazakhstan. *Public Policy and Administration*, 20(4), 2021, 410-424. <https://doi.org/10.13165/VPA-21-20-4-05>.

6 D.G., LEWIS, and S. SAGNAYEVA, Corruption, patronage and illiberal peace: Forging political settlement in post-conflict Kyrgyzstan. *Third World Quarterly*, 41(1), 2020, 77-95. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01436597.2019.1642102>.

7 C. PIEROBON, The development of civil society in post-Soviet Kyrgyzstan. *Annals of Ca' Foscari. Oriental Series*, 54, 2018, 107-134. <http://doi.org/10.30687/AnnOr/2385-3042/2018/01/006>.

The study by Idowu⁸ demonstrated how democracy and sustainable development are linked, highlighting the important ways they interact to effectively build a civic position. Consequently, the development of an active civic position, in turn, strengthens democratic institutions and creates the basis for sustainable development of the state. Dialogue between government agencies and citizens helps to prevent conflicts and resolve disputes peacefully. The institutionalisation of such interaction contributes to the cohesion of society around common goals, strengthening national unity and stability.

Thus, the purpose of the study was to analyse the mechanisms of interaction between the state, law, and society in Kyrgyzstan in the current conditions of global changes. Research objectives: to reveal the essence of the concepts of “state”, “law”, and “society” in the context of their interrelation, to characterise the main mechanisms that ensure effective interaction between the state, law, and society; to investigate contemporary global and local challenges that affect this interaction (in particular, political, economic, technological, legal, and social factors).

2. Methodology

The analysis of the relationship between the state, law, and society was carried out using an integrated approach, which involves the use of various theoretical methods and concepts. The research methodology was based on a wide range of tools, including general scientific and specialised methods. The systematic approach as a fundamental method of research allowed considering the state, law, and society as elements of a single system of political and legal relations in Kyrgyzstan. This method was used to determine how different mechanisms of interaction affect each other and the overall effectiveness of the public administration system.

Using the method of theoretical analysis, the conceptual foundations of interaction between the state, law, and society as interrelated elements of a single system were investigated. In particular, the study analysed the mixed model of state administration of Kyrgyzstan (a combination of centralised and decentrali-

8 S.O. IDOWU, Democracy and sustainable development: Emerging links for effective citizenship development strategic implementations. *Humanities, Management and Social Sciences*, 3(2), 2023, 145-165.

sed elements), the Romano-German paradigm of legal regulation of public relations and mechanisms for ensuring a balance between state power and civil society. Special attention was paid to the study of theoretical aspects of democratisation, the rule of law and the development of the rule of law in a transitional society.

Structural and functional analysis was applied to investigate the functions of each mechanism of interaction, in particular, advisory, control, and representative functions, and to investigate their role in ensuring the effective functioning of the political and legal system of Kyrgyzstan. This method was used to clarify the functions that public discussions perform in the process of making state decisions, determine the role of public-private partnership in the modernisation of the country's economy, and study the impact of state support for civil initiatives on the development of democratic processes. Using structural and functional analysis, it was also planned to investigate the dysfunctions of existing mechanisms and their negative impact on the effectiveness of interaction.

Among special legal methods, the key role was assigned to the formal legal method, which was used to analyse the regulatory framework governing relations between the state and civil society. The analysis included the Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic⁹, laws on public associations, public-private partnerships, and other relevant regulations. The source base was based on: the Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Law No. 241 of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Regulatory Legal Acts of the Kyrgyz Republic"¹⁰, the Order No. 45-r of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Kyrgyz Republic "On the Unified Portal for Public Discussion of Draft Regulatory Legal Acts of the Kyrgyz Republic"¹¹, the Law No. 98 of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Public-Private Partnership"¹², the Resolution No. 353 of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Approval of the Program

9 Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic, 2021. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/1-2/edition/1202952/ru>.

10 Law No. 241 of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Regulatory Legal Acts of the Kyrgyz Republic", 2009. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/202591/edition/1086595/ru>.

11 Order No. 45-r of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Kyrgyz Republic "On the Unified Portal for Public Discussion of Draft Regulatory Legal Acts of the Kyrgyz Republic", 2023. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/219458/edition/1224828/ru>.

12 Law No. 98 of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Public-Private Partnership", 2021. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/112275/edition/1077389/ru>.

for the Development of Public-Private Partnerships in the Kyrgyz Republic for 2022-2026”¹³. Formal legal analysis revealed gaps and contradictions in the legislation. The synthesis method was used to generalise the results obtained and develop a holistic view of the mechanisms of interaction between the state, law, society, and to develop practical recommendations.

3. Results

In the contemporary society of a democratic country, interaction between the state, law, and citizens determines the level of legal culture, stability of the political system, and social cohesion. In Kyrgyzstan, these relations have special features that are shaped by historical events, changes in political regimes, and administrative and legislative reforms. Before the country gained independence from the Soviet Union, a series of revolutions led to changes in the state (the Tulip revolution in March 2005 led to the overthrow of president Askar Akayev and the rise to power of Kurmanbek Bakiyev; the April revolution in April 2010 against President Kurmanbek Bakiyev; the 2020 political crisis began as protests against the previous results of the Kyrgyz parliamentary elections held on October 4). Legislative changes were irregular, civil society institutions collapsed, and the constitutional system became unstable. The way government interacted with society was also significantly influenced by regional differences and the clan structure of social relations, which encouraged paternalistic tendencies and hindered the development of horizontal social ties.

The state performs traditional functions: it ensures public order, implements foreign and domestic policy, organises the system of government bodies, and carries out law-making activities.¹⁴ In turn, the law serves as a guarantee for the preservation of individual rights and freedoms, and a regulatory tool. It sets the foundations for the functioning of the state, restricts its interference in personal affairs, and creates rules for social interaction. Society in Kyrgyzstan is gra-

13 Resolution No. 353 of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Kyrgyz Republic “On Approval of the Program for the Development of Public-Private Partnerships in the Kyrgyz Republic for 2022-2026”, 2022. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/7-21632/edition/1173955/ru>.

14 J. KOSTRUBIEC, The role of public order regulations as acts of local law in the performance of tasks in the field of public security by local self-government in Poland. *Lex localis – Journal of Local Self-Government*, 19(1), 2021, 111-129.

dually moving from paternalistic models to more active participation in the political and legal life of the country.¹⁵ Examples include the growth of non-governmental organisations, the development of civil society, and the growing use of social media and media as tools of public control. Elections, petitions, public hearings, and public oversight are particularly important ways that people can influence the state.

Law, as a demonstration of state will, plays the role of the main tool for legitimising power, ensuring stability and protecting human rights.¹⁶ However, the development of public legal knowledge and the ability of state institutions to implement these norms are just as important for the success of legal norms as their formal presence. This is where the main challenge manifests itself – the gap between the law and reality, when formally established rights are not always guaranteed in everyday life. Society, for its part, is not a passive object of the national policy. On the contrary, it actively declares its needs, participates in decision-making processes, forms social requests, and requirements for the authorities. The growth of civic activity, the emergence of new forms of self-organisation, the development of digital communication platforms – all this transforms the classic model of interaction between the state and society.^{17,18}

Notably, the term “citizens”, in the context of this study, refers to civil society, that is, active participants in socio-political life, both potential and current. In this regard, it is worth pointing out what is meant by the term “civil society”: civil society is a set of public institutions, organisations, and associations independent of the state, and active citizens who express and protect the interests of citizens, promote their participation in state governance and control over power.

15 A. MAMBETALIEV, *Language policies, attitudes, and beliefs in Kyrgyzstan*. Veszprem: University of Pannonia, 2022.

16 S. CARDENAS, and R.K. ROOT, *Human Rights in Latin America: A Politics of Transformation*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2022. <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv2g7v1sq>

17 N. YESSIMOV, N. IZMAILOVA, and D. YESSIMOV, Study of psychological satisfaction of population with services of the primary health care integrated into public health. *Journal of Intellectual Disability – Diagnosis and Treatment*, 8(4), 2020, 662–672. <https://doi.org/10.6000/2292-2598.2020.08.04.9>.

18 E. XHAFI, J. TETA, D.I. PHILIPPOV, E.V. KOSTYRIN, S. LEELANG, I.V. NIKOLAEVA, M.S. MARAMYGIN, N.V. RUBAN-LAZAREVA, I. MUDA, and O.V. DUDNIK, Private health insurance in the post-pandemic era: Spatial econometric market development analysis. *Emerging Science Journal*, 7(6), 2023, 2080–2096. <https://doi.org/10.28991/ESJ-2023-07-06-013>.

In other words, civil society is a space where people can unite based on common interests, values, and goals to solve social, political, and economic issues without direct state intervention. The main regulation that establishes fundamental rights and obligations, the principles of governance, and the basis for interaction between society and the state is the Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic¹⁹, which provides for freedom of association, expression of will, participation of citizens in state governance personally or through representatives.

Any public relations, including relations between the state apparatus and citizens, should be based on certain provisions, general principles, that is, principles. These principles are shown in Table 1.

Table 1. Basic principles on which relations between the state apparatus and citizens are based

Principle	Content of the principle
Interaction (partnership)	The state and citizens should act as partners, ensuring cooperation, dialogue, and consideration of the interests of both parties in the decision-making process.
Transparency	The activities of state authorities should be open and understandable for citizens; access to public information and decisions of the authorities should be ensured.
Responsibility	Public authorities and officials should be held accountable for their actions or omissions; provides for monitoring and response mechanisms.

[Source: compiled by the authors.]

These three principles form the basis for the creation of a state governed by the rule of law in which citizens and government engage in formal interaction, while promoting mutual trust, cooperation, and transparency. They contribute to the creation of an effective system of governance and development of society, maintaining a balance between the rights of individuals and the responsibilities of the state.

The principle of interaction involves active cooperation between government agencies and citizens to achieve common goals.²⁰ This means that citizens

19 Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic, 2021. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/1-2/edition/1202952/ru>.

20 O. TSISINSKA, and N. PODOLCHAK, Mechanisms and principles of interaction between public administration entities in cross-border cooperation. *Scientific Journal of Polonia*

should be able to actively participate in decision-making processes, be involved in political and social initiatives, and have access to mechanisms to influence public policy. Interaction between citizens and state bodies should not be limited only to formal contacts, but should also include constructive dialogue, exchange of opinions, and joint solution of social problems.²¹ One of these methods of interaction is to conduct public discussions during the adoption of laws and regulations. Thus, according to the Law No. 241 of the Kyrgyz Republic²², draft normative legal acts that directly have consequences for individuals and legal entities regarding their rights and freedoms, and those that control entrepreneurship, are posted on the official web portal of the regulatory body for public discussion. Draft legislative acts are published in the mass media by decision of the regulatory body, in the absence of an official portal of the body and in cases permitted by law.

In addition to the above-mentioned law, the Order No. 45-r of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Kyrgyz Republic²³ concerning the functioning of the service on the official website of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Kyrgyz Republic entitled “Unified Portal for public discussion of draft laws and regulations of the Kyrgyz Republic” was also adopted. This document states that state bodies are obliged “no later than ten working days from the date of completion of public discussion of the draft regulation to provide answers on the Unified Portal to citizens and organisations that posted comments on the discussed draft regulation”.

This format of partnership between state bodies and citizens is certainly a positive experience for Kyrgyzstan. The specific process of public discussion, including requests for a requirement or the possibility of considering public opinion, is not defined by any regulatory act. Without such a process, there is a pos-

University, 55(6), 2022, 200-208. <https://doi.org/10.23856/5526>.

21 E. SHAHINI and E. SHAHINI, The economic and political legacy of Trump's first term: Implications for the second presidency. *Politics and Policy*, 53(5), 2025, e70066. <https://doi.org/10.1111/polp.70066>.

22 Law No. 241 of the Kyrgyz Republic “On Regulatory Legal Acts of the Kyrgyz Republic”, 2009. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/202591/edition/1086595/ru>.

23 Order No. 45-r of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Kyrgyz Republic “On the Unified Portal for Public Discussion of Draft Regulatory Legal Acts of the Kyrgyz Republic”, 2023. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/219458/edition/1224828/ru>.

sibility that public opinions will not be considered at all, and in this case, participation will simply become insignificant.

It is also necessary to highlight such a form of cooperation as public-private partnership, which allows civil and business structures to participate in the implementation of socially significant projects, for example, in the field of education, healthcare, and ecology. Thus, Law No. 98 of the Kyrgyz Republic²⁴ was adopted, in addition, the Resolution No. 353 of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Kyrgyz Republic²⁵ was adopted.

Law No. 98 of the Kyrgyz Republic²⁶ sets out the legal, economic, and organisational basis for the functioning of public-private partnerships in the state. This regulation covers the procedures for initiating, preparing, conducting tenders, and implementing PPP projects. Special attention should be paid to a clear definition of the working conditions of state authorities in this area. The Law introduces the generalised concept of “PPP project” as the main form of cooperation. The document also regulates detailed mechanisms for selecting private partners through competitive procedures with certain criteria, which contributes to transparency and efficiency of this process.

Simultaneously, the analysis reveals some shortcomings in the legal regulation, in particular, this is conditioned by the lack of detailed information on the mechanisms for monitoring the fulfilment of obligations by the parties in the project implementation process, which can lead to problems in the practical application of the norm. In general, Law No. 98 of the Kyrgyz Republic (2021) provides the necessary legal framework for the development of PPPs in Kyrgyzstan, but its effectiveness will largely depend on the quality of bylaws and the practice of their application.

The public-private partnership development programme in the Kyrgyz Republic for 2022-2026 is a strategic document that aims at institutional chan-

24 Law No. 98 of the Kyrgyz Republic “On Public-Private Partnership”, 2021. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/112275/edition/1077389/ru>.

25 Resolution No. 353 of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Kyrgyz Republic “On Approval of the Program for the Development of Public-Private Partnerships in the Kyrgyz Republic for 2022-2026”, 2022. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/7-21632/edition/1173955/ru>.

26 Law No. 98 of the Kyrgyz Republic “On Public-Private Partnership”, 2021. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/112275/edition/1077389/ru>.

ges in the mechanisms of cooperation between the public and private sectors in key sectors of the economy. The legal basis of this document is based on the Law No. 98 of the Kyrgyz Republic²⁷ and provides for the creation of specialised institutional structures for project coordination. The key component is the development of the regulatory framework and standardisation of the processes of selection and implementation of partnership projects. This regulation provides for the attraction of about USD 2 billion of private investment over five years through various financial mechanisms, such as concession agreements, joint ventures, and contract management. However, the programme has certain declaratively formulated targets without a detailed explanation of their reach and realism in the Kyrgyz economy.

However, the programme lacks clear criteria for evaluating the effectiveness of its implementation, and mechanisms for making changes in case of unforeseen circumstances. It demonstrates Kyrgyzstan's intention to renew its economy by attracting private investment, but requires significant improvements in implementation tools and increased institutional capacity to achieve effective public-private interaction.

Another important regulatory document that ensures the participation of citizens and the state in the implementation of socially important projects is the Law No. 70 of the Kyrgyz Republic "On State Social Procurement"²⁸, which consolidated the institutional framework for democratising social policy through the involvement of non-governmental organisations in solving social issues. According to Article 8 of this Law, state bodies, acting as customers of social services, must form a social order on the basis of competitive selection. The state undertakes to ensure transparency of the selection processes of performers and control the quality of services provided, and state structures, in turn, are responsible for financing approved projects and monitoring their implementation, which forms a system of accountability in the social sphere.

27 Law No. 98 of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Public-Private Partnership", 2021. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/112275/edition/1077389/ru>.

28 Law No. 70 of the Kyrgyz Republic "On State Social Procurement", 2017. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/111577/edition/1268503/ru>.

The mechanism of interaction between the state and civil society is organised through a competitive selection system regulated by Article 10, contractual regulation of relations in accordance with Article 11 and mandatory reporting on the results of implementation in accordance with Article 14. Based on this system, relations between the state and public organisations become more open and understandable, which makes it possible to control the use of budget funds and improve the quality of social services provided.

The importance of this law for the development of civil society lies in creating conditions for non-governmental organisations so that they can receive state funding for the implementation of socially important projects. This not only strengthens the financial basis of the third sector, but also increases the role of public organisations in solving public problems, forming partnerships with the authorities and contributing to the decentralisation of the state's social policy. State support for public initiatives, including financing social projects, grant programmes and creating a favourable environment for the development of volunteerism, is one of the methods of attracting citizens and authorities.²⁹ Currently, such a partnership is not presented as a systemic phenomenon, although the Decree of the President of the Kyrgyz Republic No. 221 “On the National Strategy of Development of the Kyrgyz Republic for 2018-2040”³⁰ indicates that through the mechanisms of transparent, competitive financing, the state policy for the development of civil society supports initiatives of citizens aimed at promoting socially useful ideas and projects, providing society with requested services, etc. The state will work to create conditions that will allow every citizen, community, and organisation to implement their initiatives for the development of their city, village, and region. Thus, partnership relations between citizens and the state apparatus in the Kyrgyz Republic are at an early stage, certain measures have been taken in this area, but they need to be developed, including through regulatory changes. Such development contributes to more effective government, increases

29 J. BEQIRAJ, and L. MOXHAM, Reconciling the theory and the practice of the rule of law in the European Union: Measuring the rule of law. *Hague Journal on the Rule of Law*, 14(2), 2022, 139-164. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40803-022-00171-z>.

30 Decree of the President of the Kyrgyz Republic No. 221 “On the National Strategy of Development of the Kyrgyz Republic for 2018-2040”, 2018. <https://stat.gov.kg/ru//ukaz-prezidenta-kyrgyzskoj-respubliki-o-nacionalnoj-strategii-razvitiya-kyrgyzskoj-respubliki-na-2018-2040-gody/>.

citizens' confidence in the authorities and strengthens democracy.

Civil society groups play a crucial role in the relationship between the state, the law, and society. Civil society groups have become significant players in social justice and human rights initiatives in Kyrgyzstan.³¹ For example, the human rights organisation Kylym Shamy, which identifies human rights violations committed by state structures, supports compliance with the rule of law, provides legal assistance to residents of the country and increases the level of legal awareness. Through its activities, it contributes to the strengthening of civil society and the development of a democratic legal order.

Through such activities, public organisations have the opportunity to influence political and legal changes, as they actively work to improve legislation, developing initiatives related to the fight against corruption, protecting the rights of minorities, or preserving the environment. They act not only as lawyers for citizens, but also as catalysts for changes in public policy, often initiating legislative reforms aimed at improving the legal system. In particular, in 2017, Kyrgyzstan adopted a new Law No. 63 of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Protection and Defense from Domestic Violence"³², which was the result of a three-year joint campaign. This campaign brought together the Forum of women MPs, the United Nations (UN) initiative "UNiTE to End Violence against Women", representatives of civil society and the UN gender thematic group, which consists of participants from various UN agencies in the country. The forum of women MPs, which included representatives of Jogorku Kenesh, played a key role in supporting the draft law, contributing to its adoption in parliament. Simultaneously, public organisations and human rights defenders were actively engaged in the development of legislative initiatives, the preparation of analytical materials, and attracting public attention. In particular, women human rights activists and crisis centres such as Sezim provided expert advice and strengthened the content of the draft law. The adoption of this law was an important step in the fight against domestic violence in Kyrgyzstan.

31 J. JUMAGAZIEVA, *Overcoming obstacles: Examining the challenges faced by women human rights defenders in Kyrgyzstan*. Vienna: Central European University Private University, 2023.

32 Law No. 63 of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Protection and Defense from Domestic Violence", 2017. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/111570/edition/14086/ru>.

Conducting educational events to improve the level of legal knowledge of the public is one of the key aspects of the work of public organisations. Such measures help people to learn about their rights, protection options, and how to get help if their rights are violated.³³ Educational legal initiatives in Kyrgyzstan are implemented in various formats and attract numerous groups of the population. Non-governmental organisations systematically conduct seminars and trainings, such as “women’s rights in the family and society”, held in remote parts of the country. Training programmes on the topic “Labour rights of employees” for workers in textile and other industries are also in high demand, where participants receive information about their rights to decent wages, safe working conditions, and social guarantees.³⁴

Transparency, as an essential element of interaction between citizens and the state apparatus, is the main principle that guarantees the openness of government activities and the ability of citizens to receive truthful information, minimises corruption risks, increases government accountability, and encourages civic engagement.³⁵ In the field of ensuring transparency of state activities, the Open Budget platform is actively used, which allows citizens to track how budget funds are distributed. This creates opportunities for public control over government spending and promotes accountability of officials.

Transparency mechanisms include open data and access to public documents, financial reports, decisions made by the authorities; e-government and the development of online platforms where citizens can monitor the work of authorities, submit appeals and participate in discussions; civil monitoring.³⁶

One of the mechanisms for ensuring transparency is the introduction of e-government, which is provided for by the Law No. 127 of the Kyrgyz Republic

33 I.M.D. HADINATA, Enhancement of public awareness of legal language through community legal education program. *Community Service Journal of Law*, 2(2), 2023, 72-75.

34 Z.T. KONURBAYEVA, E.S. MADIYAROVA, and M.U. RAKHIMBERDINOVA, Algorithm for generating competitive potential of engineering within the regional economy. *Actual Problems of Economics*, 168(6), 2015, 236–247.

35 A. ANDRONICEANU, Transparency in public administration as a challenge for a good democratic governance. *Revista Administratie si Management Public*, 36, 2021, 149-164.

36 H. FELIZZOLA, C. GOMEZ, N. ARRIETA, V. JEREZ, Y. ERAZO, and G. CAMACHO, Enhancing transparency in public procurement: A data-driven analytics approach. *Information Systems*, 125, 2024, 102430. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.is.2024.102430>.

“On Electronic Governance”.³⁷ Based on the introduction of e-government, in particular, public service portals, digital registers, and online appeals, citizens have real opportunities to interact more quickly with state institutions. This helps to reduce the level of bureaucracy, and limits corruption risks, since there is no need for personal contacts when receiving services.³⁸ Simultaneously, digital technologies simplify obtaining legal information, increasing people’s awareness of the legislation.

Digitalisation paves the way for the application of e-justice, the automation of judicial procedures, and the creation of publicly available databases of legal acts, which is crucial for strengthening the rule of law.³⁹ In addition, digital tools are actively used in human rights activities: online petitions, social media campaigns, and digital monitoring of human rights violations have become an integral part of modern public activism. One important example is the electronic system Sanaripsot (Digital Court), which allows filing lawsuits online, viewing case materials, and participating in meetings remotely via video conference. This approach increases the accessibility of justice, especially for residents of remote regions, and promotes greater openness of the judicial system.

For civil society, digital platforms create conditions for wider participation in public and political life. Social networks, e-democracy platforms, and online forums are becoming platforms for public discussion of government decisions, expressing opinions, mobilising communities, and monitoring government activities.⁴⁰ For civil society, digital technologies have become an effective means of influence and self-organisation. For example, social networks such as Facebook and Telegram are used by activists and human rights defenders to collect signatures for petitions, monitor human rights violations, organise protests, or

37 Law No. 127 of the Kyrgyz Republic “On Electronic Governance”, 2017. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/111634/edition/1119212/ru>.

38 H. HRINCHENKO, R. TRISHCH, V. MYKOLAIKO, and O. KOVTUN, Qualimetric approaches to assessing sustainable development indicators. *E3S Web of Conferences*, 408, 2023, 01013. <https://doi.org/10.1051/e3sconf/202340801013>.

39 J. AFZAL, *Implementation of Digital Law as a Legal Tool in the Current Digital Era*. Singapore: Springer, 2024. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-97-7106-6>.

40 R., LINDNER, and G. AICHHOLZER, E-democracy: Conceptual foundations and recent trends. In: L. Hennen, I. van Keulen, I. Korthagen, G. Aichholzer, R. Linder, R.Ø. Nielsen (Eds.), *European E-Democracy in Practice*. Cham: Springer, 2020, 11-45, http://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-27184-8_2.

inform the public about important social events. Campaigns against illegal construction, corrupt appointments, or poor-quality services in government agencies often start in a digital environment.^{41,42} The principle of transparency is consolidated at the constitutional level, in particular in Article 4 of the Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic.⁴³ This principle is also consolidated in the Budget Code of the Kyrgyz Republic (Chapter 24)⁴⁴, Law No. 123 of the Kyrgyz Republic “On Local State Administration and Local Self-Government Bodies” (Articles 3, 18, 25)⁴⁵, Law No. 217 of the Kyrgyz Republic “On the Right to Access Information” (Articles 1, 4, 24, etc.)⁴⁶.

As a separate principle of interaction between the state apparatus and citizens, it is worth highlighting the principle of responsibility, which provides that the state apparatus should be accountable to citizens for its actions and for the conscientious performance of its duties to the population. Among the possible options for implementing this principle are the normative consolidation of responsibility of state bodies and officials for failure to comply with laws, abuse of authority; the implementation of public control and reporting; the possibility of filing complaints, appeals, proposals, and the response of the authorities to citizens' appeals.

In public relations, responsibility implies that public authorities and their representatives are responsible to the people for their actions and choices.⁴⁷ Re-

41 D. MUKAYEV, U. SHALBOLOVA, and J. TANAS', Housing affordability analysis in Kazakhstan based on D-HAQ model. *Journal of International Studies*, 15(4), 2022, 28–42. <https://doi.org/10.14254/2071-8330.2022/15-4/2>.

42 Z.B. UMBETBAYEVA, S.ZH. SULEIMENOVA, G.G. NURAKHMETOVA, S.A. SAIMOVA, and D. BAITUKAYEVA, The Vienna Convention for the protection of the ozone layer and its role in promoting environmental sustainability and implementation in the national legislations of participating states. *Rivista di Studi sulla Sostenibilita*, 13(1), 2023, 313–330. <https://doi.org/10.3280/RISS2023-001-S1020>.

43 Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic, 2021. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/1-2/edition/1202952/ru>.

44 Budget Code of the Kyrgyz Republic, 2016. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/111338/edition/7319/ru>.

45 Law No. 123 of the Kyrgyz Republic “On Local State Administration and Local Self-Government Bodies”, 2021. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/112302/edition/1832/ru>.

46 Law No. 217 of the Kyrgyz Republic “On the Right to Access Information”, 2023. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/4-5355/edition/11754/ru>.

47 M. LEE, Government public relations: What is it good for? In: M. LEE, G. NEELEY, K. STEWART (Eds.), *The Practice of Government Public Relations*. New York: Routledge, 2021. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003177654-2>

sponsibility includes both a legal and moral component. In case of violation of laws or improper performance of their duties, state bodies should be held accountable, and citizens should have mechanisms to protect their rights, in particular, through judicial protection or other legal means. The principle of responsibility strengthens the legal order and ensures that the authorities do not abuse their powers. The issue of responsibility of civil servants in the Kyrgyz Republic is regulated by the Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic⁴⁸, in particular, in Articles 5, 35, 109.

Public control of citizens as a type of activity is not prohibited by the current legislation of the Kyrgyz Republic, this type of activity develops as a private initiative of the public, which is in no way stimulated or supported by the state, which affects the effectiveness of such activities.⁴⁹ The rule of law is strengthened, the interests of citizens are protected, and fairer and more effective governance is the result of greater state accountability to society.

As a powerful catalyst for change, digitalisation is becoming increasingly important in Kyrgyzstan's interaction between the state, the law, and society.⁵⁰ As the world becomes digital, technology is becoming more than just a tool for improving public administration; it also plays a role in increasing government's openness, transparency, and accountability to people.

Digital inequality between different demographic groups, cybersecurity challenges, personal data protection, and information technology abuse are some of the new challenges posed by digitalisation.⁵¹ Without a proper legal fra-

48 Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic, 2021. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/1-2/edition/1202952/ru>.

49 A. GENERALOV, and O. GENERALOVA-KUTUZOVA, Economics, legal, political and social environment of entrepreneurs in Kyrgyzstan. In: M. Ince-Yenilmez, B. Darici (Eds.), *Engines of Economic Prosperity: Creating Innovation and Economic Opportunities through Entrepreneurship*. Cham: Palgrave Macmillan, 2021, 337-357. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-76088-5_18.

50 C.R. KULUEVA, B.T. TEMIROVA, B.T. MARZABAYEVA, S.S. IBRAIMOVA, and U.O. AMATOVA, The role of digitalization of education in the sustainable development of the regions of Kyrgyzstan. In: E.G. POPKOVA (Eds.), *Smart Green Innovations in Industry 4.0 for Climate Change Risk Management*. Cham: Springer, 2023, 359-367. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-28457-1_37.

51 G. AZIEVA, S. KERIMKHULLE, U. TURUSBEKOVA, A. ALIMAGAMBETOVA, and S. NIYAZBEKOVA, Analysis of access to the electricity transmission network using information technologies in some countries. *E3S Web of Conferences*, 258, 2021, 11003. <https://doi.org/10.1051/e3sconf/202125811003>.

network and institutional capacity, digital solutions may remain formal and fail to deliver the expected effect.

Based on the analysis, it is worth highlighting the following problems of interaction between citizens and the state apparatus in the Kyrgyz Republic:

- lack of clear mechanisms for implementing norms on interaction between the state apparatus and civil society is an important problem that can hinder the effective interaction of government bodies and public initiatives, hinder the development of democracy and reduce public confidence in the authorities;
- lack of mandatory mechanisms for considering the opinion of citizens when making decisions. For example, although public discussions of draft laws are provided for, they may be optional or have inefficient implementation mechanisms, which reduces the possibility of citizens interfering in the process;
- incompleteness or underdevelopment of mechanisms for monitoring the actions of government bodies. Legislation should include mechanisms of public control and the ability for citizens to intervene when the authorities abuse their rights in order to guarantee the responsibility of the authorities. Even if the right to control is technically recognised, it may not be exercised in the absence of such funds.

Thus, the interaction of the state apparatus and civil society in the Kyrgyz Republic is an essential element of the country's democratic development (Table 2). This contributes to openness, transparency, and accountability of the authorities, and strengthening citizens' confidence in state bodies.

Table 2. Interaction of the state, law, and society in Kyrgyzstan

Element	Role in the system	Interactions with other elements
State	Organises and ensures public power, performs the functions of management, protection, and control	- Issues legal acts (laws, decrees) through legislative bodies - Implements the right through the authorities
Law	System of generally binding norms governing relations in society	- Established and guaranteed by the state - Ensures law and order - Affects the behaviour of citizens
Society	Source of legitimacy of power,	- Influences the development of laws

	subject of political and legal life	through elections, civil society, and the media - Complies with or violates the right
--	-------------------------------------	--

[Source: compiled by the authors based on 52,53,54,55,56,57,58,59,60]

Various forms of citizen participation are implemented in the country, but in practice, there are often situations where citizens' opinions are not considered or processes remain formal. The main forms of participation include public hearings, public consultations in the adoption of normative acts, participation in electoral processes and the activities of public councils under state bodies, which is guaranteed by the Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic.⁶¹ The Law No. 241 of the Kyrgyz Republic⁶² provides for mandatory public discussions of draft laws concerning the rights and freedoms of citizens.

The key point is the need to create mechanisms for monitoring the actions of state bodies that will contribute to effective management and protection of citizens' rights. Legal instruments of interaction between the state and civil society

52 Law No. 241 of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Regulatory Legal Acts of the Kyrgyz Republic", 2009. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/202591/edition/1086595/ru>.

53 J. KOSTRUBIEC, The role of public order regulations as acts of local law in the performance of tasks in the field of public security by local self-government in Poland. *Lex localis – Journal of Local Self-Government*, 19(1), 2021, 111-129.

54 A. ANDRONICEANU, Transparency in public administration as a challenge for a good democratic governance. *Revista Administratie si Management Public*, 36, 2021, 149-164.

55 Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic, 2021. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/1-2/edition/1202952/ru>.

56 D. BEDNARSKA-OLEJNICZAK, J. OLEJNICZAK, and V. KLÍMOVÁ, Grants for local community initiatives as a way to increase public participation of inhabitants of rural areas. *Agriculture*, 11(11), 2021, 1060. <https://doi.org/10.3390/agriculture11111060>.

57 A. MAMBETALIEV, *Language policies, attitudes, and beliefs in Kyrgyzstan*. Veszprem: University of Pannonia, 2022.

58 S. CARDENAS, and R.K. ROOT, *Human Rights in Latin America: A Politics of Transformation*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2022. <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv2g7v1sq>

59 J. JUMAGAZIEVA, *Overcoming obstacles: Examining the challenges faced by women human rights defenders in Kyrgyzstan*. Vienna: Central European University Private University, 2023.

60 I.M.D. HADINATA, Enhancement of public awareness of legal language through community legal education program. *Community Service Journal of Law*, 2(2), 2023, 72-75.

61 Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic, 2021. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/1-2/edition/1202952/ru>.

62 Law No. 241 of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Regulatory Legal Acts of the Kyrgyz Republic", 2009. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/202591/edition/1086595/ru>.

require further improvement, in particular, by improving public discussion procedures, developing civil control mechanisms and creating effective ways to consider the opinion of society.

The interaction between the state, law, and society in Kyrgyzstan is a change that requires constant updating of management mechanisms and increasing the level of legal awareness. To develop an effective model of coexistence, it is necessary to adhere to constructive dialogue and mutual responsibility of all participants in public relations, which will create the basis for a stable democratic system aimed at trust and sustainable development.

4. Discussion

Effective mechanisms are needed to balance the interests of all parties involved in constant socio-political transformations and changes in Kyrgyzstan that affect the interaction of the state, law, and society. The rule of law serves as the basis for this interaction, where society is actively involved in decision-making. Effective mechanisms are needed to balance the interests of all stakeholders in Kyrgyzstan, where the state, law, and society interact within the framework of continuous socio-political transformations and changes. The rule of law serves as the basis for this interaction, where society is actively involved in decision-making, and the law has the highest authority. In reality, however, Kyrgyzstan faces several obstacles, such as a lack of trust in state institutions, uneven enforcement, and poor civil society development in some areas.

According to the analysis, social relations, including the interaction under study, should be based on certain foundations that reflect the key principles of legal, democratic and social statehood. The studied laws and regulations of the Kyrgyz Republic consolidate the principles of the rule of law, openness, legal equality, access to information, and citizens' appeals. Beqiraj and Moxham⁶³ emphasised that in developed countries, principles are not only consolidated in laws, but also operate through practical mechanisms, including independent courts, effective control, and transparent administrative procedures. This

63 J. BEQIRAJ, and L. MOXHAM, Reconciling the theory and the practice of the rule of law in the European Union: Measuring the rule of law. *Hague Journal on the Rule of Law*, 14(2), 2022, 139-164. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40803-022-00171-z>.

approach is typical for continental European countries, where principles such as legal equality of all citizens, the prohibition of discrimination, and ensuring open access to information and active participation of citizens in decision-making play a key role.^{64,65} Comparative analysis shows that although Kyrgyzstan legally recognises the same principles as developed democracies, the success of their implementation depends on the level of development of institutions, political culture, transparency, and de facto control of the state by citizens.

In Kyrgyzstan, there are signs of openness and democratisation, which, although contradictory, indicate progress towards harmonisation of legal norms with society. There are also certain initiatives to reform the legal system to increase its transparency and responsibility to the population. In particular, the creation of public councils under ministries and the active involvement of the public in the law-making process demonstrate that the state recognises the importance of citizens' participation in governance and understands the need to strengthen the legitimacy of its institutions.⁶⁶

Andrias and Sachs⁶⁷ suggest that law is an instrument of dominance of certain social groups. Legal norms often reflect the interests of only certain strata, and not the entire community, so the relationship between the state and citizens can be unequal. However, this thesis is not confirmed by the example of Kyrgyzstan. The introduction of digital services is a step towards improving the transparency and accessibility of public services for all population groups, not just the elite. Such tools reduce the likelihood of abuse and provide an opportunity for more equal interaction between citizens and the state. In addition, the activities of some public organisations and initiatives in the field of

64 O. PAVLOVSKYI, M. BLIKHAR, L. AKIMOVA, V. KOTSUR, O. AKIMOV, and M. KARPA, International migration in the context of financial and economic security: The role of public administration in the development of national economy, education, and human capital. *Edelweiss Applied Science and Technology*, 8(6), 2024, 1492–1503. <https://doi.org/10.55214/25768484.v8i6.2265>.

65 B.R. REXHEPI, Impact of remittances on Kosovo's economic development and poverty reduction. *Quality – Access to Success*, 24(195), 2023, 347–359. <https://doi.org/10.47750/QAS/24.195.41>.

66 A. SYZDYKOV, A. ABDIROVA, M. ARALBAYEVA, A. TAPENOVA, and T. MAKHANOV, Fraction as a legal form of activity of the parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan (taking into account the world experience). *Indian Journal of Science and Technology*, 9(16), 2016, 89832. <https://doi.org/10.17485/ijst/2016/v9i16/89832>.

67 K. ANDRIAS, and B.I. SACHS, Constructing countervailing power: Law and organizing in an era of political inequality. *Yale Law Journal*, 130(3), 2021, 546–577.

legal literacy indicate that the law can become an effective means of attracting citizens to protect their interests.^{68,69}

According to the results of the current study, the activity of public organisations in Kyrgyzstan allows them to maintain their influence on political and legal transformations. They not only respond to human rights violations, but also initiate systemic reforms aimed at improving legislation. Non-governmental organisations act not only as defenders of the interests of individual social groups, but also as catalysts for change, forming alternative views on the national policy and contributing to the creation of conditions for a more open and democratic process.⁷⁰ An example of such influential activity is the initiation of the adoption of Law No. 63 of the Kyrgyz Republic.⁷¹ In the scientific literature, in particular, in research by Miller⁷², it is noted that public organisations are considered as important entities that can influence political and legal changes. Their activities are considered key in forming the link between the state, law, and society. As noted by Miller, public organisations play the role of intermediaries that form public opinion, encourage citizens to participate in state governance, and create a legitimate basis for law-making.

As a result of the current study, it was found that cooperation between state bodies and citizens is a successful example for Kyrgyzstan. This cooperation involves the active participation of the population in management and decision-making processes. The country's constitution provides citizens with the opportunity to participate in public administration. One of the forms of such cooperation is public hearings and consultations, which allow the population to express

68 V.V. VOLKOV, Ethnic minorities in the political discourse of Latvia. *Etnograficeskoe Obozrenie*, 2017(2), 2017, 24–38.

69 V. VOLKOV, Features of the linguistic identity of the Russian population in Latvia. *Forum for Linguistic Studies*, 7(2), 2025, 882–902. <https://doi.org/10.30564/fls.v7i2.8320>.

70 A. EFREMOV, Age-specific mental health profiles of combat veterans: Post-traumatic stress disorder and related disorders. *Journal of Rational – Emotive and Cognitive – Behavior Therapy*, 44(1), 2026, 4. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10942-025-00637-7>.

71 Law No. 63 of the Kyrgyz Republic “On Protection and Defense from Domestic Violence”, 2017. <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/111570/edition/14086/ru>.

72 E.J. MILLER, Lawmaking and public administration. In: A. Farazmand (Eds.), *Global Encyclopedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance*. Cham: Springer, 2023, 7311-7315. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-66252-3_1122.

their opinion on political, economic, or social initiatives.⁷³ Such interaction contributes to a more transparent and open management process, creating conditions for dialogue between the authorities and society. From a legal standpoint, as noted by Pech⁷⁴, partnership between citizens and the state is seen as a mechanism for implementing the rule of law. Participation of citizens in decision-making processes contributes to the legitimisation of state power, ensuring its transparency and accountability, and the development of a legal culture in society. Post and Rosenblum⁷⁵ emphasised that this form of interaction is a sign of a developed civil society, which can not only control the actions of the state, but also to actively participate in solving problems both at the local and national levels.

Another pressing issue that affects the interaction of the state, law, and society is digitalisation. The experience of Kyrgyzstan considered in the current study shows that digitalisation poses a serious challenge to interaction between the state, law, and society. Digital technologies open up the potential to improve the availability of public services and improve administrative efficiency.^{76,77} The challenges of cybersecurity, digital inequality, protecting citizens' rights, and the need to improve laws to regulate these processes create new legal and social challenges. Thus, digitalisation is a two-way process that requires constant adaptation of legal and social structures to new realities. Koos⁷⁸ emphasised that new technologies are changing social and economic structures, which calls into

73 Z. AKSHATAEVA, K. BAIZHANOVA, S. BEISEBAEVA, G. SHERIMKULOVA, G. NURAHMETOVA, and Z. KHAMZINA, The framework of social security system public management in Kazakhstan. *International Journal of Environmental and Science Education*, 11(18), 2016, 11645–11657.

74 L. PECH, The rule of law as a well-established and well-defined principle of EU law. *Hague Journal on the Rule of Law*, 14(2), 2022, 107-138. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40803-022-00176-8>.

75 R.C. POST, and N.L. ROSENBLUM, *Civil Society and Government*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2002.

76 A. BARLYBAYEV and A. TURGINBAYEVA, Development and implementation of an advanced fuzzy expert system for the assessment of information security risks. *Journal of Computational and Cognitive Engineering*, 4(4), 2025, 570–580. <https://doi.org/10.47852/bonviewJCCE52024683>.

5

77 B. ABDYGALYM, M. SAMBETBAYEVA, A. YERIMBETOVA, A. NEKESOVA, N. TASBOLATULY, N. SMAILOV, and A. NAZYMKHAN, NLP models for military terminology analysis and detection of information operations on social media. *Computers*, 14(11), 2025, 485. <https://doi.org/10.3390/computers14110485>.

78 S. KOOS, Digital globalization and law. *Law Science Law Review*, 6(1), 2022, 33-68.

question traditional legal mechanisms.

The interaction between the state, law, and society in Kyrgyzstan is dynamic and contradictory, due to a number of historical, social, and political factors. The state plays a key role in shaping the legal system and managing social processes, but its effectiveness largely depends on the power of institutions, transparency of management decisions, and the ability to ensure compliance with the principles of the rule of law. Laws serve as both a tool for influencing the authorities and protecting individual rights and freedoms, although in practice there is often a gap between the regulatory framework and its application. In addition, this interaction is complicated by a number of challenges, including distrust of public institutions, legal nihilism, unequal access to justice, and insufficient development of feedback mechanisms.

5. Conclusions

The successful interaction of the three key elements of the social structure creates the basis for stable development of the country, ensuring the rule of law and respect for democratic values. The analysis shows that Kyrgyzstan is gradually abandoning authoritarian methods of government, moving to more open and democratic forms. However, this process is accompanied by difficulties that require a detailed rethinking of the role of each element of the public administration system. The state in Kyrgyzstan plays an important role in stabilising social processes, but its actions often cause distrust among the population due to the historical context, corruption, and inequality in the distribution of political power. However, in this system, the law acts as a mechanism for controlling social relations, and as a defender of human rights and freedoms, which is especially important in the context of post-Soviet development.

Law in Kyrgyzstan serves not only as a mechanism of state regulation, but also as a means of social partnership, through which citizens have the opportunity to exercise their rights, influence the national policy, and participate in the decision-making process. This is evident in the work of institutions such as public councils attached to state bodies, local government mechanisms, public hearings, and digital feedback platforms. Despite the formally established ways of participation, in practice it is possible to observe fragmentation and unevenness in the

implementation of the principle of cooperation. In particular, there are serious problems associated with weak institutional capacity and a low level of legal awareness. Kyrgyzstan has specialised institutions and procedures aimed at engaging the public in management processes, such as public councils, public hearings, e-democracy, and local self-government bodies. However, these mechanisms have limited impact due to the lack of a detailed regulatory framework, low political culture, and limited resources of civil society.

There is a growing number of human rights and public organisations that not only help people in difficult legal situations, but also actively influence national policy, create human rights initiatives, and act as verifiers of the actions of the authorities. This shows that society is beginning to take an increasingly active position in the legal process and demand greater transparency and responsibility from state structures. Effective cooperation between the state, law, and society is possible only if the institutional capacity of public authorities for transparent governance is increased, the principles of openness, accountability, ensuring the rule of law and active participation of citizens in decision-making processes are introduced.

It should be emphasised that this interaction is not a one-off event; it requires a systematic approach based on the principles of mutual responsibility, transparency, accountability, and trust. A partnership model based on dialogue and cooperation should not be an exception, but a standard for Kyrgyzstan's democratic development. Further research should focus on a more detailed study of the effectiveness of specific mechanisms of citizen participation in public administration, such as public councils, public consultations, and e-government tools. Special attention should be paid to the investigation of the real impact of these tools on the development of public policy, and to the study of factors that limit their effectiveness.